

Criminal Defense Unit

evin M Stadelmaier
Chief Attorney

Danielle H Maichle
Managing Attorney

Claudia S Schult
Managing Attorney

Michael S Deal
Managing Attorney



Staff Attorneys

Daniel E Barry r
Farina Barth
Monica Delmonte
aura El-Bahtity
Holly Erick
Sophie Feal
enneth oldberg
Miles resham
evin Harris
Roland W Hayes
ori Hoffman
essamine Ingrid ackson
Charles R at
Steven C os
thena E McCrory
illian Medina
Carrie Phillips
Sean F Rheinheimer
Sarah Ryan
ustin Schifano
Rebecca Town
aitlynn E Walker
Samantha I White
arla immerman

MEMORANDUM OF SUPPORT

S.1716 (Bailey) /A.1431 (Lentol) –
The 2019 Discovery for Justice Reform Act
February 8th, 2019

The Legal Aid Bureau of Buffalo’s Criminal Defense Unit, the largest provider of indigent defense services in the City of Buffalo, urges the Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign comprehensive criminal discovery reform this session. We strongly support the Discovery for Justice Reform Act S.1716 (Bailey) /A.1431 (Lentol), which will repeal the current “Blindfold Law” and bring early, open, and automatic discovery to our criminal legal system.

In New York, unlike most of the rest of the country, prosecutors and police are not required to provide copies of police reports and other crucial documents or information or evidence related to their case to people facing criminal allegations or their attorneys until trial begins – months or years after an arrest. Because the vast majority of cases end in either dismissals or plea deals, rather than trials, nearly everybody who is accused of a crime in New York may never see all of the evidence. In short, they are “blindfolded.” This includes police reports, witness statements, exculpatory information, and more. That is why many call New York’s discovery law the “Blindfold Law.”

This unfair law fuels mass incarceration, case delays, and wrongful convictions. It prevents people facing criminal accusations from making informed decisions about plea offers, forcing many to choose between pleading guilty or suffering the well-documented brutality of jail while fighting the charges against them without access to crucial evidence.

Nearly every other state in the country has employed systems of broad access to both parties’ evidence at an early stage of criminal cases for many years. Prosecutors and defense attorneys alike in these states consistently say broad discovery works and no state that has reformed its discovery statute has since gone back to reverse its progress.

New York's antiquated criminal discovery laws stand in stark contrast to its law in civil cases, where only money is at stake, not someone's liberty. In New York civil cases, both parties are required to turn over all of the information, though live testimony, called depositions, questions and answers, called interrogatories and production of documents. Yet, people facing jail or prison, a criminal record, and a lifetime of related consequences, like loss of employment, housing, educational opportunity and deportation are not currently afforded even the most basic information prior to making a decision about whether to plead guilty or as they proceed to trial.

Again, the Legal Aid Bureau of Buffalo's Criminal Defense Unit urges the legislature to pass and the Governor to sign comprehensive discovery reform this year.

Questions? Contact Chief Attorney Kevin Stadelmaier at 716-853-9555 ext. 219 or kstadelmaier@legalaidbuffalo.org